Fez as a locus of migration processes on the move: integration and mutation of citizenship

Moha Ennaji, Filippo Bignami, Mohammed Moubtassime, Mounia Slighoua & Fouad Boulaid

Routledge
Taylor & Francis Group

Check for updates

Fez as a locus of migration processes on the move: integration and mutation of citizenship

Moha Ennaji[a], Filippo Bignami[b], Mohammed Moubtassime[c], Mounia Slighoua[d] and Fouad Boulaid[c]

[a]Institute for Languages and Cultures, Sidi Mohamed Ben Abdellah University, Fez, Morocco; [b]Department of Business Economics, Health and Social Care, The University of Applied Sciences and Arts of Southern Switzerland-SUPSI, Manno, Switzerland; [c]Department of English, Sidi Mohamed Ben Abdellah University, Fez, Morocco; [d]Institut Euromed des Sciences Juridiques et Politiques, Euro-Mediterranean University, Fez, Morocco

ABSTRACT
This article aims to define the main facets and challenges of undocumented migrants on the move in Fez city (Morocco) and their impact on neighbourhoods and on society at large. It seeks to measure the integration of sub-Saharan migrants in the host community through the metrics of their participation in economic and social activities in urban space and discusses the main hurdles impeding their integration. The data show that there is, on the one hand, a quite low degree of acceptance by the local population, which in general tolerates their presence although signs of discrimination and prejudice in certain neighbourhoods are observed. On the other hand, the sample shows that some sort of partial integration occurs through forms of micro-entrepreneurial activities and use of city services. Further, the article proposes the idea of rethinking the concept of citizenship in order to understand the new flows of migration. It shows that the concept of citizenship needs to be re-considered beyond the formal and legal dimension, in order to include informal dimensions for a more realistic rendering of the interaction between migrants and the city. Unlike Isin (2017. "Performative Citizenship." In *The Oxford Handbook of Citizenship*, edited by Ayelet Shachar, Rainer Bauböck, Irene Bloemraad, and Maarten Vink, 500–523. Oxford: Oxford University Press) and others who focus mainly on acts of citizenship as political, the article reveals that migrants perform their own acts of citizenship through social interaction, in line with Ong's (2007) theory of mutations of citizenship.

KEYWORDS Sub-Saharan migration; Fez; integration; informal citizenship; city

Introduction

Morocco is still essentially a country of emigration, although it is slowly becoming a destination country for refugees and sub-Saharan African

migrants and, to a lesser extent, for Europeans (Yachoulti and Jabos 2020; Mourji et al. 2016, 53). The growing presence of these immigrants since 2000 confronts the Moroccan society with an entirely new set of social, cultural, political, and legal issues (Ennaji 2019; Lahlou 2018; Berriane, de Haas, and Natter 2015, 503). Most of them use Morocco as a step to reach Europe, trusting that it is the safest passageway, but they end up waiting for months or years in appalling conditions (Ennaji and Bignami 2019). Others have decided to settle in the country, after so many trials to move to Europe. Given the ongoing disaster of migrant deaths in the Mediterranean Sea, Morocco's role in managing the migrant problem is key.

In September 2013, the Moroccan government took new measures to improve the living conditions of migrants. These steps came after King Mohammed VI called for a more compassionate outlook to managing migration and for a policy that would offer residency permits to handpicked migrants living illegally in the country. This humanitarian approach in favour of undocumented migrants and refugees led the government to launch the 2014 regularisation programme and to make changes in the Refugee Status Determination Process in Morocco, as recognised by the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). The regularisation programme allows undocumented immigrants already living in the country the possibility to obtain a legal status either permanently or temporarily. This programme was used 'as a government tool to consolidate its political and economic rapprochement with West Africa.' (Yachoulti and Jabos 2020).

Despite the regularisation scheme, these migrants face forms of xenophobia, racism, and at times absence of rights at border crossings. Thus, according to the Antiracist Group for the Support and Defense of Foreigners and Migrants (GADEM), the 2013 migration plan has not resulted in substantial improvements in the situation of these migrants. At the regional level, the European Union puts pressure on Morocco to keep migrants from entering Europe, particularly since the EU decided to tighten security over its borders following terrorist attacks in France (2015) and Spain (2017). Analysts have criticised Morocco's migration approach for lack of clarity in the regularisation programme and the mistreatment of undocumented migrants (Yachoulti and Jabos 2020; Alioua 2011).

Fez, as a locus of study, is a strategic choice for exploring the migration phenomenon in a profound way. Founded in the 8th century by Moulay Idriss II, Fez is characterised by its cultural, ethnic, and religious diversity. It has historically been able to deal with difference in reference to its Andalusian connection; it has been a commercial centre and city of cultural exchange. It is located in northern inland Morocco and is today the capital of the Fez-Meknès administrative region. It is the second largest city after Casablanca, with a population of 1.150 131.[1] Located to the northeast of the Atlas Mountains, Fez is situated at a crossroad connecting the important

cities of different regions, particularly Tangier in the northwest and Marrakesh in the southwest, which leads to the Trans-Saharan trade route. Fez, has a complex structure, as it consists of two old *medina* quarters, *Fez* el-Bali and *Fez* el-Jdid, and the much larger modern urban *Ville Nouvelle* and a mellah (Jewish quarter) which was the home of the Jews of Fez for more than 500 years. Fez used to be the capital of Morocco before the French protectorate (1912–1956), and has an interesting history with sub-Saharan Africans (Miller, Petruccioli, and Bertagnin 2001).

Fez has been throughout its twelve centuries of existence a veritable melting-pot of ideas, religions, languages, and traditions. Most notable amongst its landmarks is the shrine of Ahmed Tijani, founder of the Zawiya Tijaniyya sufi order, visited by thousands of Muslim people from many sub-Saharan countries like Niger, Senegal, and Mali. The role played by this sanctuary was characterised by defining 'factors in the new attraction of Fez for sub-Saharan immigrants, as it provides a more peaceful environment, where it is possible for them to blend in and integrate into the city' (Berriane et al. 2013, 491). Besides geographic and historical factors, migration flows have been pushed by droughts and conflicts ravaging their countries and by the search for more stable living prospects and the desire to better their lives.

Various challenges have characterised migration in recent years. According to the Statistics Office (Haut Commissariat au Plan), the unemployment national average in 2019 reached 24.9% among young people under 24 compared to 7% among those aged 25 and over. In urban cities like Fez, the rate is 39.2% and 9.9% respectively.[2] This high unemployment rate among Moroccan youth pushes the government and the private sector to prioritise unemployed Moroccans over undocumented sub-Saharan migrants. Previous studies dealt with Morocco as a sending country or with Africans in host European countries (Lahlou 2018; Ennaji 2014). The case of undocumented migration has been particularly thought-provoking and calls for a novel approach, which studies patterns of social contacts between these new migrants and the city while they try to transit to Europe.

Migration has traditionally been studied mainly from the perspective of points of departures and arrivals. However, the temporal continuity of migration flows compels us to zero in also on migrants on the move. Our aim is to understand the movement of migrants rather than only the places where they settle, and framing it in the interaction between migration and citizenship, beyond but also still intertwined with nation-states, particularly in Morocco (Ennaji and Bignami 2019; Perrin 2014). This suggests that migration necessitates unceasing attention by all stakeholders, for economic reasons and for humanitarian purposes. All state and non-state actors must constantly take migrants into consideration, chiefly their socio-economic needs.

Rather than adopting a European attitude toward migrants, or focus on border control, we propose an original analysis of migration processes focused on how cities work and fit as migration junctions along the migrants' routes. This analytical approach can open up new avenues for new theories of migration in general. In other words, we argue for a new perspective focused on the city where the flows take shape, with the aim of understanding sub-Saharan migrants' situation, their interactions with the local population, their main activities, difficulties, strategies, and finally formal and informal participation, and degree of integration.

The article, which is based on interviews, argues that sub-Saharan migrants struggle to develop their integration and participation in the city through micro-entrepreneurship, socio-cultural activities, or through informal means. It discusses the efforts made by the migrants, local authorities, and civil society organisations to help migrants integrate in the city and strengthen social cohesion by diminishing poverty and reducing inequalities.

The article seeks to tackle migration from a novel approach delving into the most relevant challenges and questions pertaining to the particularities of the Moroccan case and the city of Fez. Therefore, through the conducted fieldwork it has been fundamental to measure integration through multiple levels, including individual, collective, and institutional levels (Pennix 2007). In effect, the fieldwork has sought to understand the dreams, hopes, and aspirations of the interviewed migrants. Their integration, as it appears in reality, is more complex than the reviewed conceptualizations. Thus, there is a need for an approach which goes beyond the classic portrayal of integration in order to establish the existence or absence of the new forms of integration and participation of migrants.

Academic discussions of integration are different from Moroccan policy definitions and goals in the sense that the latter are geared to ensure and preserve security and social cohesion in the city. The situation on the ground in Fez is much more composite than the academic definitions and understanding of integration of undocumented migrants.

For local government and civil society organisations, there is urgent need to take measures to ensure the safety and wellbeing of the migrants, which would help their smooth integration in the city. Likewise, local authorities should incorporate a migratory dimension in their development strategies, re-examining their procedures so as to integrate them in education, health and housing services, the job market, and other areas.

Within this approach, stress is put on the local level, where such policies are implemented and are mostly felt, both by the migrants themselves and by the city dwellers who are also affected by migration. The reason for allotting some space to these issues is the affirmation that any integration policy should be based on a systematic scientifically-based knowledge of the processes of integration or non-integration: if a policy aims to direct such a

process, it should know what tools it can use conceivably to intercede and at what specific time.

Another major research objective of this article is: to understand respondents' migration intentions and experiences in Morocco, focusing on their means of livelihood and social relationships as measures of migrants' integration in the city. Furthermore, the article aims at discussing the changes induced by undocumented migrants (economic initiatives, social aggregations, and the local population's attitudes to them) and the ways through which these initiatives develop. The article is both descriptive and analytical in the sense that it seeks to provide qualitative data in order to comprehend the social interactions of sub-Saharan migrants and their integration or not in the city of Fez. Such a phenomenon cannot be analysed without a thorough understanding of multiple variables relevant to the findings, as shown in the section below. The article adopts the theoretical approach of informal citizenship whereby migrants exercise activities and acts of citizenship informally without being actually legal citizens.

Conceptualisation and theoretical background: integration and informal citizenship

This section introduces and defines the key concepts used, i.e. integration; informal or performative citizenship (rather than formal, legal citizenship). The main argument here is that the city is the space of integration of migrants, as they perform their own citizenship through social interaction and economic micro-entrepreneurship. Understanding 'migrant-city interaction' entails shifting interest from the traditional analyses of the concept of 'integration' and choosing novel lenses. For Phalet and Swygedouw (2003), integration entails the 'extension to non-nationals of legal, social, cultural and political rights, and opportunities that were once the exclusive entitlements of nationals.'

Integration can be portrayed as a 'process through which individuals participate in the global society through their professional activity, learning norms of social consumption, adoption of familiar cultural behaviours, and participation in the common institutions' (Schnapper 2008, 3).

States can no longer afford to contribute unilaterally to 'better' migrant-city interaction(s). Input(s) from other stakeholders are required (De Haas 2005). Integration, thus, is to be conceived as an 'empowering process' (Schnapper 2008). A distinction ought to be made between policies of integration and the more complex sociological concept of integration.

Kumlin and Rothstein (2010) underline two major variables with regards to integration: non-discriminatory treatment of migrants and informal relationships with the neighbourhood. The first variable is relevant to the public sphere, while the second one is relative to interactions between individuals.

The two variables are interconnected to the extent that 'the way migrants are treated in public has an impact on the way they are treated in private' (Mourji et al. 2016, 92).

Beyond the integration of migrants in a location or city, interaction patterns are key variables. They are essential to the extent that the city shapes migration, and the latter shapes the city. It is in this sense that interaction is at play between migrants and the urban space (Chauvin and Garcés-Mascareñas 2012, 248).

In these definitions, integration often presupposes legal documentation or citizenship. Isin (2007) and Chauvin and Garcés-Mascareñas (2012, 253) frame it in contrast not as a legal status but as a matter of performance. Meanwhile states and policy-makers define it more narrowly in legal and government authority terms. The disconnect between academic definitions of integration and (informal) citizenship and policy makers' definitions creates tensions in evaluation and misunderstandings in media. The spaces of integration are central as well. Chauvin and Garcés-Mascareñas (2012, 253) point out that the city has been a key site of migrant performances of citizenship or integration, although they focus on political activism rather than the livelihood strategies of migrants.

For the purposes of this article, we define integration as the overall procedure or process whereby one individual or community mixes with, or adapts to, the host society without losing their own identity (integration rather than assimilation). This general definition does not entail that integration will lead to the uniformity of society, but allows variables like ethnicity, gender, race, class, and religion to be part of the broad picture of integration. As far as economic dimensions are concerned, we argue, following Arcand and Jézéquel (2018, 82–85), in favour of entrepreneurship as an opportunity for migrants' 'economic' integration. Integration, in the framework of this article, designates a complex and multidimensional process. Data gathered through the different interviews portray such a complexity.

Integration and citizenship, especially informal citizenship, are thus interrelated. The interaction between the city and the migrants relies on delving into a citizenship perspective, in terms of understanding conditions and features that, in a city scale setting, enable a 'performative' mode of participation (Isin 2007, 2017) and, on the other hand, elicit the practices used to achieve a concrete role and interaction between city and migrants (McNevin 2017; Holston and Appadurrai 1999; Sassen 2002). This two-fold aspect of citizenship implies considering both its formal and informal dimensions, as outlined below.

Citizenship may be regarded as 'the right to a voice and an agreed level of support by the state, in exchange for meeting certain obligations and

responsibilities' (Brown, Braithwaite, and Lyons 2010, 16). As outlined by Habermas (2003, 171):

> Membership in a political community confirms special duties, behind which stands a patriotic identity. This kind of loyalty reaches beyond the validity claims of institutionally prescribed legal duties.

The political and social concept of citizenship is traditionally framed as a 'nationally bounded membership' (Fischman and Haas 2012). As a legislative and normative term, it provides people living in a nation-state with certain civil, social, political, and economic rights and responsibilities. The most important criteria for being a citizen from this perspective are to obey the laws and norms of the land, to work, to vote, and to pay taxes. This 'classic' approach to citizenship focusing, on rights and responsibilities, has a universal claim, but it does not consider marginalised and oppressed people who are denied formal rights of citizenship. It seems necessary, then, to 'expand' the definition of citizenship to comprise human rights, participation, and inclusion (Torres 2015).

Markedly, undocumented migrants seem to fit within such an 'informal citizenship' definition, as 'unauthorized migrants face an original type of formalized and normalized civic precariousness' (Chauvin and Garcés-Mascareñas 2012, 253). In Morocco, access to health services by sub-Saharan migrants, for instance, is problematic to the extent that they are part of the most vulnerable populations in the country who are excluded from health care. In effect, sub-Saharan peddlers and street vendors in Fez could be compared to 'street traders' who ' … do not exist, living in legal vacuum outside and beyond the law' (Brown, Braithwaite, and Lyons 2010, 2). In this sense, Sassen claims that

> … we can identify a type of informal citizen who is unauthorized yet recognized, as might be the case with undocumented immigrants who are long-term residents in a community and participate in it as citizens do. (Sassen 2009, 240)

For Bauader (2008, 323), informal citizenship can be seen as 'a dimension of membership in a national community related to practices of identity and belonging'. Such 'a mechanism of distinction' is applicable to migrants who 'are not considered "to belong" to the nation-state community, even if formally they are entitled to'. Yet, there is a sort of 'informal social contract' that binds undocumented immigrants to their communities of residence' (Sassen 2009, 240). In effect, Sassen (2009, 235) outlines multiple dimensions of citizenship, including 'cultural', 'economic', and 'psychological' dimensions which are crucial for a proper definition of citizenship and for relationships with the community. Furthermore, citizenship makes a distinction between migrants and non-migrants, and undocumented migrants are categorised as sub-citizens; not as non-citizens, as the data analysis will reveal (Chauvin

and Garcés-Mascareñas 2012, 253). This is referred to as 'denizenship' and 'right to the city' in urban studies (Turner 2016).

Formal citizenship could be defined as 'a mechanism for allocating rights and claims through political membership' which has been rooted in 'nation-states' (Brysk and Shafir 2004). However, with the accentuation of transnational flows, 'the nature of citizenship' shifts (Brysk and Shafir 2004). As pointed out by Brysk and Shafir (2004), 'globalization has put some flows out of the reach of states, putting rights at risk, but also created new levels of membership and rights claims'.

Citizenship as a dynamic concept has evolved profoundly, as 'there is a growing movement that specifically claims "the right to the city"' (Smith, Peter, and McQuarrie 2012). In this sense, 'the claim to have rights is associated with membership in a city rather than a nation' (Smith, Peter, and McQuarrie 2012). As such, there are 'multiple modes of belonging beyond legal citizenship and place of *birth*', such as civic responsibility and residence which are increasingly mobilised to claim citizenship and consequently rights (Smith, Peter, and McQuarrie 2012). As outlined by Ong (2005), 'we are moving beyond the recent past when citizenship as a package of territorialised rights seemed immutable to the flux and conjunctures of global flow'. Besides, citizenship 'is not just a legal status that is conferred, a gift from the state. Citizenship is something that is taken as much as it is given' (Smith, Peter, and McQuarrie 2012).

Regarding informal citizenship, as illustrated in the framework of this article, it can be assimilated to the 'new ways of being or becoming citizens' (Isin and Nielsen 2013). Throughout this article, migrants are portrayed as informal citizens with rights in the city (Isin and Nielsen 2013). Indeed, the conducted research sought to investigate 'everyday deeds' and 'the existential conditions of possibility of acts' (Isin and Nielsen 2013). Moreover, this article seeks to delve into critical studies of citizenship which uncovered that 'what is important is not only that citizenship is a legal status but that it also involves practices of making citizens – social, political, cultural, and symbolic' (Isin and Nielsen 2013; Ong 2006).

The shift in focus from formal to informal citizenship is a key passage to read a phenomenon that is *per se* always changing, evolving, and in negotiation between the individual and the community. Of course the testbed of this shift cannot be the nation-state, as it does not seem to be the best institutional actor to host such flexible mutations, since citizenship is a challenge for the state, which is used to formalising and conveniently giving a legal interpretation to the idea of citizenship (Balibar 2015, 158). Further, we argue that the shift from formal to informal citizenship, to work better, needs a parallel change of institutional actors: from the nation-state to the city.

Thus, we use the concept of citizenship in a broad informal way in the sense of Ong (2005). While citizenship is usually intended, in juridical

terms, to signify the tie between the individual and the state as an institutional entity, it is increasingly being used in a broader sense as the analytic-reconstructive parameter implying the quality of the individual, while also defining access to certain social resources in an institutional framework (Ennaji and Bignami 2019, 73; Bignami 2017).

Methodology

The data hereafter described and interpreted were collected through semi-structured interviews with sub-Saharan migrants (see appendix). Data collection took place within the project 'The city of Fez as a locus to investigate migration processes on the move', a bilateral Swiss-Moroccan one year project funded by Swiss State Secretariat for Education, Research and Innovation (SERI) through the leading house University of Applied Sciences Western Switzerland (HES-SO). Participants were sampled given the way they have migrated from sub-Saharan Africa and according to their status in Fez at the time of the survey, as shown in the following Table 1:

Regarding the methodology used, a qualitative approach has been adopted in order to allow a better understanding of the problems, the integration pathways, as well as the perceptions and feelings of the people involved. In particular, the sample used allows a descriptive perspective.

A useful sample of 45 undocumented migrants has been followed to collect data through semi-instructed interviews. The snowball method (Atkinson and Flint 2001) has been selected, since it allows access to 'hard-to – reach' populations. One of the constraints linked to the fieldwork conducted is how to access the targeted population. The snowball sampling method helped us to build the trust of the few to gain access to an extended network. Through this method, early respondents contributed in recruiting future ones amongst their networks and acquaintances. The respondents were from various neighbourhoods of Fez: Mont Fleuri, Atlas, Narjis, Erac, Bensouda, Sidi Brahim, and Hay Najah. Given this method (a qualitative approach and snowball in sampling), it is not possible to ensure that the sample has real statistical representation, but it allows a good descriptive reliability.

The semi-structured interviews took place in French or English at a place preferred by the interviewees, such as their neighbourhoods or at their workplaces where they beg or peddle. The interviews lasted from half-an-hour to one hour. Participants were asked questions in *ad hoc* meetings prior to the semi-structured interviews in order to give them an idea about the purpose of the research, which was an opportunity for them to express themselves. A semi-structured list of questions was used as an interview guide, and the answers were carefully recorded. The interviewees were from different sub-

Table 1. Characteristics of interviewed individuals (only their first names have been used to preserve their anonymity).

Answerer	Country of origin	Gender	Age	Level of education
Amadou	Côte d'Ivoire	M	21	Primary
Adama	Côte d'Ivoire	M	24	High school
Soulaymane	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	Primary
Aboulaye	Côte d'Ivoire	M	22	High school
Daouda	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	No level
Ahmadou	Côte d'Ivoire	M	24	Primary
Mariam	Côte d'Ivoire	F	21	High school
Siaka	Côte d'Ivoire	M	21	University
Yao	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	Primary
Maimouna	Côte d'Ivoire	F	27	No level
Drissa	Côte d'Ivoire	M	29	University
Konan	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	Primary
Saydou	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	No level
Yaya	Côte d'Ivoire	M	22	University
Kouami	Côte d'Ivoire	M	23	Primary
Kouassi	Côte d'Ivoire	M	25	Primary
Fatou	Senegal	F	26	High school
Omar	Senegal	M	25	Primary
Babakar	Senegal	M	26	University
Moussa	Senegal	M	22	Primary
Ahmadou	Senegal	M	27	University
Oussman	Senegal	M	32	High school
Fatouma	Senegal	F	29	University
Abdou	Senegal	M	31	Primary
Assan	Senegal	M	33	Primary
Victor	Nigeria	M	26	University
Joy	Nigeria	F	28	High school
Paul	Nigeria	M	25	University
Johan	Nigeria	M	23	Primary
Alam	Nigeria	M	26	Primary
Emmanuel	Nigeria	M	34	No level
Samuel	Nigeria	M	21	Primary
Michael	Nigeria	M	23	Primary
Ibrahima	Togo	M	21	No level
Zahera	Togo	F	23	Primary
Aichatou	Togo	F	24	Primary
Adama	Togo	M	26	No level
Ali	Mali	M	25	High school
Mamadou	Mali	M	27	Primary
Alioune	Mali	M	25	No level
Aminatou	Guinea	F	28	High school
Djibril	Guinea	M	27	Primary
Sylla	Guinea	M	28	No level
Dona	Benin	F	24	University
Abubakr	Benin	M	21	Primary

Saharan countries, such as Côte d'Ivoire, Guinea, Mali, Togo, and Senegal of both genders and different age groups. The interviews were conducted between November 2018 and January 2019.

For the interviews, a multifold investigation of closed and open ended questions was used. Twelve questions dealt with the demographic and socio-economic profile of the respondents, eight addressed their education, skills and livelihood, ten were family-related, and two questions focused on

violence-related issues. Finally, twelve questions raised the issue of informal citizenship and integration in an urban context. In addition to the fieldwork conducted, the research is based on observation and previous work, such as articles, case studies, reports, and newspaper commentaries. The qualitative data collected have been processed through a text analysis with the support of SPSS software.

Findings

Sub-Saharan migrants' demographic and socioeconomic profiles

We examined mainly background and demographic variables such as nationality, age, gender, religion, languages spoken, migration trajectory and family structure of the migrant. It turned out that interview data was less robust than expected, and survey data was more useful. Regarding their trajectory, migrants who settled in Fez, had often been expelled from northern Morocco by the police, most notably from the cities of Tangiers, Nador, and the Spanish enclaves of Ceuta and Melilla.[3] The European dream is an initial incontestable driver for many, who consider Morocco a transit area. However, some migrants choose Morocco as a host destination with the intention of settling in the country. Such a decision is taken either as a result of disillusionment, resignation, or by conviction.

The majority of the interviewees had left their countries between 2012 and 2014. Most of them had migrated in search for better opportunities. While some escaped conflict and poverty, others migrated to look for employment. Findings regarding migration push factors confirm the hypotheses that the search for security, better prospects, and economic opportunities were the most significant causes. Johan, 23 years old, from Nigeria stated: 'I have come all the way to Morocco to make a decent living, but if I have a chance to cross to Europe, I will definitely do that.'

Gender, age, and nationality

The sub-Saharan migrants in Fez are mostly men. Women tend to be less visible in the city landscape. Out of forty-five interviewed participants, thirty-six were men and nine were women. We met mostly men because women were less available. The hardships linked to migration routes may account for such a finding (Moghadam and Verticelli 2019; Ennaji and Sadiqi 2008).

As for the nationality of the respondents, it varied in the conducted survey. The majority came from Côte D'Ivoire (16), 9 from Senegal, 8 from Nigeria, 4 from Togo, 3 from Mali, 3 from Guinea, and 2 from Benin.

Regarding the age of the interviewees, the majority of them were young. Only seven out of the forty-five were aged thirty or more; the rest of the respondents were aged between 21 and 29. Half of them were single.

For many of them, family links remain strong, despite the distance. Indeed, being far from one's family is another difficulty sub-Saharan migrant endure. They do feel happy when they get a chance to call their families and still feel close to them when calling. One of the Togolese interviewees by the name of Ibrahima, 21 years old said: 'I am happy when I call my parents in Togo. But when I call my mother, she cries all the time, and this makes me anxious.'

Education and training background

The level of education of undocumented migrants raised various questions, notably regarding their employment prospects. A low education level decreases potential professional opportunities and may lead to social exclusion. One third of them had a higher degree or a high school level of education; the rest were illiterate or had primary education level. The majority of the interviewees had left school because of poverty, while some explained that they dropped out of school because of low grades. Fatou, a 26-year old girl from Senegal, had a high school level but had to quit for the following reasons; she said:

> My mother died in a car accident; my father re-married two months later, then my step-mother obliged me to help her with the housework most of the time, which discouraged me from finishing my education. But now, my aim is to go back to school or to do some kind of vocational training, at least.

Some respondents had manual skills such as carpentry, masonry, hairstyling, or cooking. However, the majority of the respondents could not find employment in Fez in fields where they could use their training and talents.

Migrants' activities

The low education and training level of the respondents do not allow many employment prospects. The lack of opportunities pushed many of them to resort to begging in the major city roundabouts in order to earn a living. When asked why they begged, Dona a 24-year old graduate student from Benin said: 'I have no income, no money to live on. Without begging I will starve to death.' Others were peddlers, hairstylists, or cooks. With regard to activities, it seems that the sample population interacts positively with the city (apart from the idle and beggars) doing different sorts of work activities, including micro-entrepreneurial ones, however precarious they may be.

Even when sub-Saharan migrants succeeded in finding a day-job, they were sometimes abused by employers, who would, for example, make them carry heavy luggage for little pay. Since they did not have a work permit, they often accepted to do hard tasks under difficult conditions for

a small amount of money. When asked if they had considered engaging into a micro-entrepreneurial activity, the majority of the interviewees responded in the negative. Ahmadu, a 27-year old university graduate from Senegal answered: 'I have no money to live on, let alone start a small business. I wish I can start a business in the future, God willing.'

City-migrants' interaction

City-migrants' interaction was studied through multiple questions, including: migrants' activity in the city, their sense of belonging and identity, their future plans, their interaction with the local community, and their use of city services and technology. Most migrants used to rent spaces in 'hut camps' near the Fez train station for 10 dirhams per day, until their huts were destroyed in December 2018 by the local authorities. They had to move to different poor neighbourhoods of the city. Some of them shared housing with other undeclared roommates or with regular migrants, mostly West African students. Ali, a 25-year old from Mali, stated the following: 'I had to run for my life, when the police intervened and started burning down our huts at five in the morning. The whole camp was in flames. Everyone got out and ran away.'

The vast majority of the interviewed migrants did not consider their situation secure or stable, and perceived the future to be dim. At times, silence or refusal to respond was indicative of a negative perception of livelihood and security in Fez.

Beyond the basic profiles of these migrants, we raised questions about their feelings of belonging which determined their interaction with the host community. Most of them felt attached to their countries of origin; while about a third of them seemed to emphasise their African identity, a few did not provide an answer when asked about their identity. Djibril, a 26-year old man with primary education level, from Guinea, indicated: 'It does not matter which country I come from. What matters is that I am African, and so are Moroccans. We badly need African solidarity here.' Such a reaction expresses feelings of fear and uncertainty about the future.

Many indicated that racism was a major obstacle to their integration. For Michael, 23 from Nigeria, it is impossible to integrate in Morocco because he feels there are prejudices against Blacks. 'I cannot live nor integrate in a society where I am discriminated against and hardly accepted.' Less than one third mentioned that they did not experience segregation. The main factors feeding racist feelings among Moroccans were fear of the migrants and false prejudices spread by the media (Mourji et al. 2016). Understanding this process and the causes of fear is essential, as fear reduces the possibilities of integration of the migrant in the transit or host society. Results established by the OECD in 2016 show that there is a gap between analyses of the

incidence of migration on development at the economic level and local perceptions of migrants by the public. Factors such as lack of information and biased media are to blame (Manço, Joseph, and Saïd 2017).

Although it has been established by the findings that the respondents felt marginalised, most of them (60%) affirmed that they had Moroccan friends, whom they met in the neighbourhood where they lived, in the mosque, or on the street. Their Moroccan friends were often young people of their age, mainly students and workers. Mariam, 21, from Côte d'Ivoire, attested: 'I have a few Moroccan friends, whom I have met in the neighbourhood where I live or at work. They are really helpful and supportive.' In their free time, undocumented migrants found multiple activities like playing football, hanging out in cafes, or gathering with other sub-Saharans or Moroccans. Some respondents spent their free time in cyber cafes, which is indicative of a search for connection with friends and families or for employment. Despite their precarious situation, they have set up their small social and cultural organisations to enhance their integration and participation in the city.

Concerning the interaction of the interviewed migrants with the city services, more than a third of them declared that they did have access to health facilities. Some visited religious facilities (e.g. mosques, churches) and about half went to the Moroccan *hammam* (Turkish bath). Fatouma, a 29-year old BA holder from Senegal, answered:

> As a Muslim, I have access to mosques, to the *hammam*, and my son goes to a public school. But we do not have direct access to health care in the public health centers in the city. There is a lot of bureaucracy and discrimination at this level.

Another respondent, Moussa, 22 years old from Senegal, mentioned that he 'did not have easy access to health services in the hospital.'

To the question whether and how new technologies and internet helped them as far as accessing information was concerned, the majority of respondents affirmed that they did not have a smartphone. For example, Yaya, a 22-year old young man from Côte d'Ivoire, stated: 'Without my smartphone and the social media, I will feel more excluded and isolated. I use my smartphone to call my friends for help and to stay in touch with my family back home.' However, the rest of the respondents admitted that they used the smartphone to get updates, to stay in touch with their families and friends, and look for job opportunities.

Analysis

The interaction between the city and the sample of migrants surveyed showed that, in spite of not being officially citizens in the legal and administrative sense, they did engage in behaviours and activities that were close to

those of 'informal' citizens. Activities linked to work, like peddling and street vending, micro-entrepreneurial actions, relations with other migrants, limited use of city facilities and services and different practices of housing played a very important role in the development of multi-layered forms of interaction within the city. Some associations (like Fès Saiss Association) provided them with assistance, namely blankets, food, and clothing; others (like Association Caravane Nour and The Moroccan Red Crescent) offered them training work-shops mainly about safety, agriculture, carpentry, plumbing, masonry, and hairstyling. Thus, migrants interact with the local community, albeit slowly and in a fragmented timely fashion with a perspective of 'differential inclusion' which 'points to a substitution of the binary distinction between inclusion and exclusion with continuous parametric modulations – that is, processes of filtering and selecting that refer to multiple and shifting scales, ratings and evaluations.' (Mezzadra and Neilson 2012, 68).

The concept of 'differential inclusion' is used here to demonstrate the selec-tive inclusion of migrants within the domain of rights in the host country in contrast to the idea of borders as devices of exclusion or inclusion. This study provides an empirically grounded analysis of the differential inclusion of undocumented migrants as non-citizens and underscores the legal hierar-chies between the latter and citizens. In addition to the regulation of residence and the access to labour markets, the unequal access to the welfare system rep-resents a significant scope of discrepancy in the immigration process. As Könönen (2017) argues, 'non-citizens' social entitlements differ depending on the nationality, the type of legal status and the form of employment, affecting their position in the labour markets and in the society.' Overcoming the difficulties of integration entails that a vibrant form of negotiation of new social and spatial conditions is launched in the city.

The interactions at stake are chiefly of a social nature, which necessitates answering questions about how to respond to the needs of the migrants in the host community, and how to include them in economic activities. The data reveal that all migrants are in dire need to integrate the economic sphere by finding salaried jobs or starting their small businesses. Thus, the relationship between the data found and the National Strategy for Immigra-tion and Asylum led by Morocco shows that, despite the regularisation cam-paign in favour of undocumented migrants, the latter are not integrated in the community nor fully accepted by the population of Fez.

Integration requires concerted action in various key sectors such as housing, education, and training. This study has revealed the needs of undo-cumented migrants and the multiple challenges they raise. Major difficulties have been underscored, such as the difficulty of obtaining assistance with administrative and legal procedures, housing, employment, accessing public services, pursuing education and training, in addition to the issues of learning Arabic and other new skills such as marketing, computing, and

internet skills. For example, one of the respondents, Soulaymane, 23 years old from Côte d'Ivoire, mentioned that he 'could only read, write and do basic maths, but was computer illiterate,' as his level of education did not exceed primary school.

Progress towards meeting migrants' needs entails public-private partnerships, which brings together civil society actors, corporate leaders, and state actors working within the city. Indeed, the social responsibility of private actors calls for their contribution to the development of the city which is impacted by migration, the multiple challenges it poses, and the perspectives or opportunities it offers.

The request above regarding the impact of migrants on the city can be met by enabling a political and social way of creating an area of mutual trust between migrants and the city. It can happen through empowering all the actors involved, in building a win-win interaction.

A multidimensional vision of migrants' participation is necessary because obstacles facing migrants are multiple and composite. Several factors ought to be taken into consideration, such as gender, class, education, age, and culture. These factors are composite in the sense that they add up and intersect to define the potential prospect of migrants' integration. Thus, migrant-city interaction also entails societal action and reflection on the political, economic, and cultural dimensions.

The city must adopt an inclusive approach which deals with migration in a multidimensional way, while also deconstructing any preconceived ideas on migration. Unjustified resentment among decision-makers can potentially lead to non-integration of migrants. As pointed out by Brown, Braithwaite, and Lyons (2010, 3), 'fear appears to impel exclusion, and traders are feared for undermining order'. Conversely, migration can be a positive factor which helps the job market to adapt to the mutations of the economy.

As pointed out above, sub-Saharan migrants in Fez do suffer from discriminatory treatment. They can be denied rent just because they are black African migrants (Mourji et al. 2016, 63).[4] Ahmadou, 24 years old from Côte d'Ivoire, stated that

> local citizens do not offer us job opportunities, and we do not have easy access to health care services; even some natives avoid renting their houses to sub-Saharan Africans. I get upset but there is nothing I can do about it.

To the question whether undocumented migrants received any help from the local authorities concerning employment, housing, health, and education, Aichatou (24 years old from Togo) answered: 'not that much from Moroccans, but we feel that the natives are prioritized in all sectors'.

Another interviewee, Alam (26 years old from Nigeria) added: 'one of the biggest problems we encounter is daily harrasment. We often hear pejorative

words like "harraga" (illegal migrants in Arabic), "azzi" (nigger in Arabic). It has become part of our daily life.'

More than a third of our respondents were beggars at city roundabouts and crossroads, or at the main gates of mosques. Amadou, 21 years old from Côte d'Ivoire, said: 'I earn between 100 Moroccan DH and 200 DH a day from begging when it is sunny, and between 15 and 30 DH when it is rainy.' At least one third of them earned a living as street vendors (selling African crafts, jewelries, hand watches, etc.). Others worked in restaurants as waiters or cleaners, or as helping workers in factories. Aminatou, 28-year old waiter from Guinea, stated: 'I earn a minimum wage salary of 3000 DH a month. Most customers are nice, but there are some naughty young ones who call me names like "azzia" (nigger) when I go out in the street.'

Mamadou, 27 years old from Mali, expressed his wish to live in Morocco:

> Now I earn a living as a waiter in a café. I send a small amount of money to my parents back home once in three months. If I get a decent stable job, there will be no need for me to move to Europe.

Although their experiences are not always good, many of them have positive views of their stay and would want to settle in the city if they had a decent income-generating activity (Pickerill 2011, 406; Cherti and Collyer 2015, 595).

The data analysis reveals several drivers of interaction and effects that migrants have on the city, at the social level. A non-negligible part of respondents have stated their intentions: (1) to stay in Morocco (most probably in the same city); (2) to interact positively with the local social context despite obstacles; (3) to use as much as possible city services and facilities; (4) to carry out, temporarily, forms of jobs like peddling or street vending, or start a small business, if they can benefit from external support; (5) to use public spaces like coffee shops to arrange meetings, like eating together during their free time; (6) to use new technologies and internet with different but precise purposes.

Thus, sub-Saharan migrants encounter numerous hurdles upon their arrival in Fez. They must adjust to a new climate, way of life, code of conduct, and legislation. Their integration depends on many factors, namely their level of education, economic status, age, gender, duration of residence, social support or lack of it, attitude, mastery of Arabic and French and other skills. Migrants with a high level of education often integrate more easily than those with low or no education. Similarly, those with material resources, positive attitude, and social support adapt faster than migrants with limited resources and no family support.

Lack of adaptation causes stress and a feeling of isolation to most migrants, and discrimination and unemployment usually prevent them from integration. Abubakr, 21 years old from Benin, had this to say: 'I do not feel quite integrated into the host city of Fez because I am discriminated

against as a black young man, have no income, and suffer from harassment in the street on a daily basis.' Another respondent, Zahera, 23 years old from Togo, added: 'Although I am with my husband, I do not feel quite integrated because I am a poor undocumented migrant woman. I occasionally work as a helper or as a cleaner in some households. But I have no rights.' Paul, 25 years old from Nigeria, had a similar attitude:

> I am a street vendor. I make enough money to keep body and soul together; that is all. I do not complain, as I have some good friends, Moroccan and sub-Saharan, but honestly I am not that integrated into the Morocco community of Fez.

To integrate into the city, and regardless of socio-cultural obstacles, these minorities are expected to circumvent communitarian practices that might be understood as non-integration in the host society. It is self-evident that integration is crucial for the well-being of migrants and for social cohesion in the city. It is central for the Moroccan policy-makers and local authorities to invest in integration programmes in favour of migrants, because integration has a positive effect on both the migrants and the society they live in. While the government has attempted to protect them and has bolstered regularisation programmes in favour of their integration, by documenting approximately 50,000 illegal migrants since 2014, local authorities in Fez have done too little to help, and have unfortunately turned their backs to undocumented migrants and refugees (Yachoulti and Jabos 2020, 150).

The findings demonstrate that the balance between integration and informal citizenship is a useful theoretical perspective which can help to grasp the interactions of migrants with the city. For example, it is a fact that some migrants, as well as Moroccan citizens, cannot find employment, and for this reason their interactions entail a reformulation of the notion of citizenship, disassembling and reassembling its dimension according to the logic of the above described differential inclusion. Thus, the city is the most significant urban setting where different forms of integration and interaction are shaped and concretised (Cattacin and Zimmerman 2016; Isin 2007; Sassen 2005; Nyers and Rygiel 2012). It enables rights and duties, participation, identity, and membership. Citizenship in this context can be discussed under the perspective of an urban setting as a possible contemporary alternative to long-established notions of citizenship, those built on the pillars of rights, duties, identity, and membership to a political entity, usually a nation-state (Purcell 2003).[5] This form of right to the city is practiced in the most direct sense, as a right to configure and use the urban space in its material and immaterial, formal, and informal manifestations. In reaction to diverse pressures, such as migration flows, spatial segregation, and social inequalities, urban informal citizenship is emerging through social and economic activities to better reflect the identity, participation, and entitlement to exploit the city

from its migrants, and it seems then appropriate to seek the support of institutions with appropriate and practical instruments in order to challenge the barriers hampering integration and informal citizenship, as described in this sample about Fez (Bignami 2017).

Conclusion

This article has attempted to gain first-hand insights into undocumented migrants in the city of Fez, in order to describe their interaction with the city. It reports findings from fieldwork and analyses the impact of migrants on the social fabric of this city. The major challenges to the integration of sub-Saharan migrants are related to their disadvantageous status in the labour market, their poor skills, language problems, and the host society's negative attitude to them. As a result, they face serious socio-economic difficulties and are socio-culturally poorly integrated or non-integrated (El Hamel 2014).

The article shows that Fez has several interactions with migrants, albeit informal and not structured. Although some of these migrants have been recently legalised and documented, their integration is very slow or unplanned. However, the city offers them an opportunity to settle down, work, and eventually integrate. Concerning their prospects for employment and sociocultural integration, many respondents who migrated to Fez for economic reasons felt pessimistic.[6] The fieldwork confirms that sub-Saharan migrants strive to earn a living despite the difficulties to find employment. A few considered remaining in Morocco if they could secure employment and sufficient revenue. The study endorses the fact that there are both constraints and opportunities with respect to activities grounding informal citizenship. As shown above, the migrants' performances of citizenship are entangled in their bottom-up and self-organized interaction with the city, substantiating that citizenship is also the product of ongoing social, political and economic deliberation and construction based on the criteria that are circumstantial (Benhabib 2004) but meanwhile with a trajectory. This leads us to regard the city (in this case Fez) as a location of a multiplicity of the global (Cuppini 2017) where migrants assume a role in redefining and expanding the notion of citizenship.

Under the current circumstances, the road to accomplish integration and informal citizenship is rocky (as many undocumented migrants are socially excluded or left on the margin). The need of finding an area of mutual trust among all the stakeholders (migrants and the city instances) is surely basic to substantiate forms of informal citizenship. The difficulty to integrate and achieve informal citizenship in this context is due to many factors, in particular lack of an official local policy that seeks to integrate these migrants or include them in the socio-economic life of the city, the negative attitude of

most of the local population, the economic deprivation and low level of education of most migrants. Instead local authorities and civil society organisations prefer to provide the bare minimum public services and to rely on old security strategies and approaches. This perspective can be slowly deconstructed by increasing concrete interactions between migrants and the city and fostering their integration and participation through work and social activities. One way of facilitating integration is to continue the legalisation process that the state launched in 2014. Education, vocational training, and use of new technologies and social media as powerful sources of information are crucial ways to prop migrants' participation and integration (Ennaji and Bignami 2019, 75).

The study reveals the existence of a gap between the political official discourse on migration reform and the reality on the ground at the local and national levels. While the conversation about migration reform shows a significant transformation in the attitude of the Moroccan government toward undocumented migrants and refugees, it also demonstrates the structural restrictions blocking reforms, particularly the absence of a national strategy and political vision, and, notably, the contrast between promises made by the state and the difficult living conditions of migrants. Although there is need for new reforms that guarantee migrants and refugees' rights, at the time of writing, no new migration reform is in view and no innovative law has been recently discussed by the Moroccan parliament. The 2013 migration law, and the ensuing 2014 documentation campaign 'represent a step in the right direction, but neither has resulted in a significant shift in the daily lived realities of migrants in Morocco.' (Yachoulti and Jabos 2020).

The government need to take measures to make the best use of transnational labour mobility. They should include a migratory dimension in their national and local development strategies and re-examine their regulations, so as to integrate the migrants in education, health care, housing facilities, the job market, and in all walks in life. This article calls for rethinking migration questions such as integration, identity, participation, and the right to the city: questions which are intimately and traditionally linked with citizenship.

At the theoretical level, going beyond Isin (2017), Sassen (2009), and others who focus primarily on acts of citizenship as political, this study shows that migrants implement their own acts of citizenship through their participation, on the one hand adhering to Mezzadra and Neilson (2012)'s concept of differential inclusion explained above, and on other hand following Ong's (2006) theory of mutations of citizenship. However, a low degree of integration occurs at the level of the city and through informal means rather than through achieving a formal status.

Notes

1. Source: https://www.populationdata.net/pays/maroc/ (accessed on Sep. 19, 2020).
2. See this report: https://www.hcp.ma/La-situation-de-la-population-active-en-chomage-en-2019_a2461.html (accessed on May 15, 2020).
3. Some migrants were purposefully expulsed from these cities to Casablanca and Béni-Mellal in central Morocco. Likewise Morocco has succeeded in extraditing an important number of undocumented migrants to their home land countries.
4. See this discussion between the Congolese writer In Koli Jean Bofane and the Tunisian historian Maha Abdelhamid on the theme of racism in the Maghreb: https://www.lemonde.fr/afrique/article/2019/05/12/en-afrique-du-nord-il-y-a-des-codes-sociaux-qui-excluent-les-noirs_5461175_3212.html (accessed on Aug. 11, 2019).
5. The urban citizenship standpoint started to be discussed more vigorously in the end of the 20th Century, when it was clear that the nation-state was not anymore adequate to collocate the concept of citizenship (Sassen 2002, 2005).
6. Today with the Coronavirus outbreak in March 2020, the situation of migrants has changed upside down. As a result of border closure and of curfews, they are facing a tougher time across the country and in all of Africa. See this relevant article: https://www.bbc.com/news/world-africa-52645702 (accessed on May 17, 2020).

References

Alioua Mehdi. 2011. "Jeunes transmigrants subsahariens au Maroc." In *Pratiquer les frontières : jeunes migrants et descendants de migrants dans l'espace franco-maghrébin*, edited by Françoise Lorcerie, 59–81. Paris: CNRS-Editions.
Arcand, Sébastien, and Myriam Jézéquel. 2018. "L'entrepreneuriat, une voie d'intégration et de contribution au marché du travail." *Gestion* 43 (1): 82–85.

Atkinson, Rowland, and John Flint. 2001. "Accessing Hidden and Hard-to-reach Populations: Snowball Research Strategies." *Social Research Update* 33 (1): 1–4. Accessed August 25, 2019. http://sru.soc.surrey.ac.uk/SRU33.html.

Balibar, Etienne. 2015. *Citizenship*. Cambridge: Polity Books.

Bauader, Harald. 2008. "Citizenship as Capital: The Distinction of Migrant Labor." *Alternatives: Global, Local, Political* 33 (3): 315–333.

Benhabib, Seyla. 2004. *The Rights of Others. Aliens, Residents and Citizens*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Berriane, Mohamed, Mohammed Aderghal, Mhamed Idrissi Janati, and Johara Berriane. 2013. "Immigration to Fes: The Meaning of the New Dynamics of the Euro-African Migratory System." *Journal of Intercultural Studies* 34 (5): 486–502.

Berriane, Mohamed, Hein de Haas, and Katharina Natter. 2015. "Introduction: Revisiting Moroccan Migrations." *The Journal of North African Studies* 20 (4): 503–521.

Bignami, Filippo. 2017. "Going Intercultural as a Generative Framework of a Respondent Citizenship." In *Intercultural Praxis for Ethical Action. Reflexive Education and Participatory Citizenship for a Respondent Sociality*, edited by Maria Giovanna Onorati, Filippo Bignami, and Furio Bednarz, 21–29. Louvain: EME publications.

Brown, Alison Margaret Braithwaite, and Michal Lyons. 2010. "Seen But Not Heard: Urban Voice and Citizenship for Street Traders." In *Africa's Informal Workers: Collective Agency, Alliances and Transitional Organizing in Urban Africa*, edited by Ilda Lindell, 33–45. London: Zed Books.

Brysk, Alison, and Gershon Shafir, eds. 2004. *People Out of Place: Globalization, Human Rights and the Citizenship Gap*. London: Routledge.

Cattacin, Sandro, and Annette Zimmerman. 2016. "Urban Governance and Social Innovations." In *Social Innovation in the Urban Context*, edited by Taco Brandsen, Adalbert Evers, Sandro Cattacin, and Annette Zimmerman, 21–44. London: Springer.

Chauvin, Sébastien, and Blanca Garcés-Mascareñas. 2012. "Beyond Informal Citizenship: The New Moral Economy of Migrant Illegality 1." *International Political Sociology* 6 (3): 241–259.

Cherti, Myriam, and Michael Collyer. 2015. "Immigration and Pensée d'Etat: Moroccan migration Policy Changes as Transformation of 'Geopolitical Culture'." *The Journal of North African Studies* 20 (4): 590–604.

Cuppini, Niccolo. 2017. "Dissolving Bologna: Tensions Between Citizenship and the Logistics City." *Citizenship Studies* 21 (4): 495–507.

De Haas, Hein. 2005. "Morocco: From Emigration Country to Africa's Migration Passage to Europe." *Migration Policy Institute*. Accessed January 20, 2019. https://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/morocco-emigration-country-africas-migration-passage-europe/.

El Hamel, Chouki. 2014. *Black Morocco: A History of Slavery, Race, And Islam*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Ennaji, Moha. 2014. *Muslim Moroccan Migrants in Europe*. New York: Palgrave.

Ennaji, Moha, ed. 2019. *The Maghreb-Europe Paradigm: Migration, Gender and Cultural Dialogue*. London: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.

Ennaji, Moha, and Filippo Bignami. 2019. "Logistical Tools for Refugees and Undocumented Migrants: Smartphones and Social Media in the City of Fès." *Work Organisation, Labour & Globalisation* 13 (1): 62–78.

Ennaji, Moha, and Fatima Sadiqi. 2008. *Migration and Gender in Morocco*. Trenton: Red Sea Press.

Fischman, Gustavo E., and Eric Haas. 2012. "Beyond Idealized Citizenship Education: Embodied Cognition, Metaphors, and Democracy." *Review of Research in Education* 36: 169–196.

Habermas, Jürgen. 2003. "Citizenship and National Identity: Some Reflections on the Future of Europe." In *Citizenship: Critical Concepts. Globalization: Global Membership and Participation*, edited by Roland Robertson and Kathleen E. White, Vol. 3: 155–174. London: Taylor & Francis.

Holston, James, and Arjun Appadurrai. 1999. "Cities and Citizenship." In *Cities and Citizenship*, edited by James Holston, and Appadurai Arjun, 1–18. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Isin, Engin F. 2007. "City State: Critique of Scalar Thought." *Citizenship Studies* 11 (2): 211–228.

Isin, Engin F. 2017. "Performative Citizenship." In *The Oxford Handbook of Citizenship*, edited by Ayelet Shachar, Rainer Bauböck, Irene Bloemraad, and Maarten Vink, 500–523. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Isin, Engin F. and Greg M. Nielsen, eds. 2013. *Acts of Citizenship*. London: Zed Books Ltd.

Könönen, Jukka. 2017. "Differential Inclusion of Non-Citizens in a Universalistic Welfare State." *Citizenship Studies* 21 (1): 53–69. Published online: 26 Sep 2017. Accessed September 18, 2020.

Kumlin, Staffan, and Bo Rothstein. 2010. "Questioning the New Liberal Dilemma: Immigrants, Social Networks, and Institutional Fairness." *Comparative Politics* 43 (1): 63–80.

Lahlou, Mehdi. 2018. "Regional Migration Dynamics and Implications for Innovation and Development in North Africa." In *Handbook of Migration and Globalisatio*, edited by Anna Triandafyllidou, 247–261. Cheltenham/Northampton: Edward Elgar Publishing.

Manço, Altay, Gatugu Joseph, and Ouled El Bey Saïd. 2017. "La diversité culturelle: un atout pour l'entreprise?" In *L'apport de l'Autre : Dépasser la peur des migrants*, edited by Altay Manço, 59–66. Paris: L'Harmattan. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/322101688_La_diversite_culturelle_un_atout_pour_l%27entreprise_Pour_citer_cette_analyse (accessed Aug 28 2019).

McNevin, A. 2017. "Learning to Live with Irregular Migration: Towards a More Ambitious Debate on the Politics of 'the Problem'." *Citizenship Studies* 21 (3): 255–274.

Mezzadra, Sandro, and Brett Neilson. 2012. "Between Inclusion and Exclusion: On the Topology of Global Space and Borders." *Theory, Culture & Society* 29 (4-5): 58–75.

Miller, Susan Gilson, Attilio Petruccioli, and Mauro Bertagnin. 2001. "Inscribing Minority Space in the Islamic City: The Jewish Quarter of Fez (1438–1912)." *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 60 (3): 310–327.

Moghadam, Valentine, and Alice Verticelli. 2019. "The Arab Spring and Women's Movements in North Africa." In *The Palgrave Handbook for African Women's Studies*, edited by Toyin Falola, and Olajumoke Yacob-Haliso, 1–15. New York: Palgrave.

Mourji, Fouzi, Jean-Noël Ferrié, Saadia Radi, and Alioua Mehdi. 2016. *Les migrants sub-sahariens au Maroc : Enjeux d'une migration de résidence*. Rabat: Konrad Adenauer Stiftun.

Nyers, Peter, and Kim Rygiel, eds. 2012. *Citizenship, Migrant Activism, and the Politics of Movement*. New York: Routledge.

Ong, Aihwa. 2005. "(Re) Articulations of Citizenship." *PS: Political Science & Politics* 38 (4): 697–699.

Ong, Aihwa. 2006. "Mutations in Citizenship." *Theory, Culture and Society* 23 (2-3): 499–505.

Pennix, Rinus. 2007. "Integration Processes of Migrants: Research Findings and Policy Challenges." *Migracijske i etničke teme* 23 (1-2): 7–32. Institut za migracije i narodnosti. Accessed May 10, 2020. https://www.ceeol.com/search/article-detail?id=196658.

Perrin, D. 2014. "Struggles of Citizenship in the Maghreb." In *Handbook of Global Citizenship Studies*, edited by E. F. Isin, and P. Nyers, 230–239. London: Routledge.

Phalet, Karen, and Marc Swygedouw. 2003. "Measuring Immigrant Integration: The Case of Belgium." *Studi Emigrazione / Migration Studies* XL (152): 773–803. Accessed September 29, 2019. http://adapt.it/adapt-indice-a-z/wp-content/uploads/2014/04/phalet_swyngedouw.pdf.

Pickerill, Emily. 2011. "Informal and Entrepreneurial Strategies Among Sub-Saharan Migrants in Morocco." *The Journal of North African Studies* 16 (3): 395–413.

Purcell, Mark. 2003. "Citizenship and the Righ to the Global City: Reimagining the Capitalist World Order." *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research* 27 (3): 564–590.

Sassen, Saskia. 2002. "The Repositioning of Citizenship: Emergent Subjects and Spaces for Politics." *Berkeley Journal of Sociology* 46: 4–25.

Sassen, Saskia. 2005. "The Repositioning of Citizenship and Alienage: Emergent Subjects and Spaces for Politics." *Globalizations* 2: 79–94.

Sassen, Saskia. 2009. "Incompleteness and the Possibility of Making: Towards Denationalized Citizenship?" *Cultural Dynamics* 21 (3): 227–254.

Schnapper, Dominique. 2008. "Intégration nationale et intégration des migrants : un enjeu européen." *Questions d'Europe* 90: 1–6.

Smith, Michael Peter, and Michael McQuarrie, eds. 2012. *Remaking Urban Citizenship: Organizations, Institutions, and the Right to the City*. London: Routledge.

Torres, Carlos Alberto. 2015. "Global Citizenship and Global Universities: The Age of Global Interdependence and Cosmopolitanism." *European Journal of Education* 50 (3): 262–279.

Turner, Brian. 2016. "We Are All Denizens Now: On the Erosion of Citizenship." *Citizen Studies* 20 (6-7): 679–692.

Yachoulti, Mohammed, and Anna Jabos. 2020. "Migration Reform in Morocco: Political and Social Realities Behind the 2014 Regularization Program." In *Managing Cultural Diversity in the Mediterranean Region*, edited by Moha Ennaji, 13–168. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.